



Cass Commercial Real Estate Lending Survey

Mid-year 2018 Update Report

October 2018

The Cass CRE Lending Survey is sponsored by:

Allen & Overy | Association of Property Lenders | GVA | British Property Federation | Canada Life Ltd | Link Asset Services | CREFC Europe | Fitch Ratings | Helaba | JLL Corporate Finance Limited | Crestbridge | Savills | Royal Bank of Scotland | Maslow Capital

The Cass CRE Lending Survey:

Project director, survey and analysis by Dr Nicole Lux.

Report designed and written by Dr Nicole Lux and Professor Tony Key.

Copyright © Cass Business School 2018.

All rights reserved. No part of this report (including associated graphs, data, appendices or attachments) may be reproduced in any material form, distributed or communicated to any third party, without the express written permission of the copyright owner.

Requests for permissions to use content, quotations or extracts from the report, should be addressed to Nicole.Lux@city.ac.uk

Disclaimer

The opinions and commentary in the report are those of the author(s) and not necessarily those of Cass Business School; the opinions expressed in this report should not be attributed in any way to the third parties who contribute data to the report or who financially support or sponsor the reports publication.

Commentary in the report is based on likely industry developments at the time, future trends or events based on information known to the authors at the date of publication, and such commentary should not be relied upon as a basis of financial investment. The report's authors and publisher accept no responsibility, whatsoever, on decisions based on the report which should not be relied upon as a basis for entering into transactions without seeking specific, qualified, professional advice.

We exercise professional skill and care, using reasonable effort, to ensure that the Cass Commercial Real Estate Lending Report is free from error or omissions. Whilst facts have been rigorously checked, Cass Business School can take no responsibility for any expense, damage, loss or liability suffered as a result of any inadvertent inaccuracy within this report. In the event of any errors or omissions we may correct the report without any obligation or liability to you, and we do not accept any liability if this report is used for an alternative purpose for which it is not intended.

Acknowledgements

The authors are grateful for the on-going financial report for this work provided by the sponsor firms listed on the front cover. The analysis relies on the commitment of time and effort in providing information from the staff of 82 lenders, listed in Appendix 4.

The CRE Lending Survey was originated in 1999 by Bill Maxted and Trudy Porter of De Montfort University who continued the work up to 2015. We are indebted to the original authors for the historic data, analysis and insights underpinning the current results.

Contents

Summary	i
1. Introduction	1
1.1. Survey methodology	1
1.2. Report structure	1
1.3. Main classifications and labelling	2
2. Debt and the market cycle	3
2.1. Lending volumes	3
2.2. A loan default history	5
2.3. Summary	6
3. Lenders – loan books and origination	7
3.1. Outstanding loans	7
3.2. Loan originations	8
3.3. The lending market	10
3.4. Lenders and loan sizes.....	12
3.5. Summary	13
4. Collateral – loan types and market exposures	14
4.1. Purpose of loans	14
4.2. Loans and the capital stack	16
4.3. Development lending.....	16
4.4. Regional market exposure.....	18
4.5. Summary	19
5. Underwriting – interest rates and lending terms	20
5.1. Debt costs and yields	20
5.2. Debt yield & sustainable LTV	21
5.3. Interest rate policy & hedging	23
5.4. Target LTV and lending margins	24
5.5. Development loans.....	28
5.6. Summary	29
6. Loan book quality	31
6.1. Loan book risk	31
6.2. Defaults and loss provisions	33
6.3. Lender sentiment.....	34
6.4. Summary	35
Appendix 1: Lending Terms June 2018	36
Appendix 2: Additional charts	45
Appendix 3: Lender comments	49
Appendix 4: Respondents to the mid-2018 Survey	50

Charts

Figure 1 Outstanding loans & market indicators, indices average 1999 – June 2018 = 100,	3
Figure 2 Loan origination & market indicators, Indices average 1999 – June 2018 = 100,.....	4
Figure 3 Loan origination & and transactions volumes 2000-2018, £bn	4
Figure 4 Value of loans in 90-day default as % of outstanding loans 2007-2018	5
Figure 5 Outstanding loans by lender type, £ bn and % of total.....	7
Figure 6 Loan originations by lender type, £ bn and % of total 1999 – June 2018	8
Figure 7 Origination as % outstanding loans by lender type, 2013 – June 2018	9
Figure 8 Loans by size as % of outstanding loan value by lender type, June 2018.....	12
Figure 9 Lender % share of value of outstanding loans by loan size, June 2018	12
Figure 10 Outstanding loans by type of collateral, £ bn 2007 – June 2018	14
Figure 11 Origination of loans by purpose, £ bn 2007 – June 2018.....	14
Figure 12 Origination of loans by purpose & lender type, % by value 1st Half 2018	15
Figure 13 Origination of loans by purpose & lender size of loan book, % by value 1st Half 2018	15
Figure 14 Origination of subordinated loans by lender type, £ m 2005 – June 2018.....	16
Figure 15 Development – outstanding loans, £bn 2003 – June 2018, £bn	17
Figure 16 Development exposure and origination rate by lender type, 1st half 2018	17
Figure 17 Share in total development loans by lender type, % 1st half 2018	18
Figure 18 Loan originations by lender type and market area, % by value 1st Half 2018	18
Figure 19 Borrowers' costs and property yields, % 2012 – June 2018	20
Figure 20 Spread between MSC property yields and borrowers' costs, bps 2012 – June 2018.....	21
Figure 21 Income and debt yields, % 1999 – June 2018, %	22
Figure 22 Illustrative sustainable LTV % given target debt yields 1999 – June 2018	22
Figure 23 Borrowers' cost and corporate bond yields %, 2013 – June 2018	23
Figure 24 Interest rate basis, % by value of outstanding loans by lender type, June 2018	24
Figure 25 Interest rate basis, % by value of outstanding loans by loan book size, June 2018	24
Figure 26 Average of maximum senior loan to value ratio by property sector, % 2008 - June 2018.....	25
Figure 27 Average senior lending margins by property type bps, 2008 - June 2018.....	25
Figure 28 Prime office - target lending terms for senior and junior loans, 2008 – June 2018.....	27
Figure 29 Secondary office – target lending terms for senior and junior loans, 2008 – June 2018	27
Figure 30 Target senior lending margins for development loans bps, 2000 – June 2018.....	28
Figure 31 Outstanding loans by LTV band, % of book value 2013 – June 2018	31
Figure 32 Outstanding loan by ICR band, % of book value 2013 – June 2018.....	31
Figure 33 Outstanding loan % of value by loan LTV band and lender type, June 2018	32
Figure 34 Outstanding loan % of value by loan LTV band and lender size, June 2018.....	32
Figure 35 Outstanding loan % of value by loan ICR band and lender type, June 2018.....	33
Figure 36 Lender concerns, % of responses – June 2018.....	34

Appendix 2 - Additional Charts

Figure 37 Origination by refinancing vs acquisition & type of project.....	45
Figure 38 Type of new financing by type of project & geography ex UK.....	45
Figure 39 New origination by geography & lender origin & new European origination	45
Figure 40 Loan book by type of project.....	46
Figure 41 New origination by geography, lender size, & type of project	46
Figure 42 Loan book structure by size of loan & lender origin	46
Figure 43 Loan book structure by type of lending & interest rate hedging & lender size	47
Figure 44 European outstanding loan book	47
Figure 45 Typical loan size offered for investment finance & development finance.....	47
Figure 46 Loans size by size of lending institution	48
Figure 47 Senior & junior margin ranges (25th perc, 75th perc, average, min, max).....	48
Figure 48 Senior & junior LTV ranges (25th perc, 75th perc, average, min, max)	48

Tables

Table 1 Lender concentration - June 2018.....	10
Table 2 Lender mix by type and size of loan book June 2018	11
Table 3 Senior debt – target lending terms by property type, June 2018.....	26
Table 4 Average senior lending terms for development loans, June 2018	28

Appendix 1 - Additional Tables

Table 5 Lending margins & spreads bps to 5yr BBB UK corporate bond by property type and LTV	36
Table 6 Average senior lending terms by lender type for prime assets	37
Table 7 Average senior lending terms by lender type for secondary assets.....	38
Table 8 Average senior lending terms by lender type for alternative assets.....	39
Table 9 Average junior lending terms by lender type for prime assets	40
Table 10 Average junior lending margins by lender type for secondary assets	41
Table 11 Average junior lending margins by lender type for alternative assets	42
Table 12 Average development lending terms by lender type	43
Table 13 Ranges in lenders' margin quotes by property type and loan type, June 2018.....	44

Summary

This summary first states of the headline results from the 2018 mid-year update of the Cass Commercial Real Estate (CRE) Lending Survey, then summaries the main points from the more detailed breakdowns and time-series analysis in the main body of the text.

The Survey Sample

For June 2018, Survey responses were received from a total of 82 lending organisations, comprising 42 Banks and Buildings Societies, 11 Insurance Companies and 29 Other Lenders. A full list of lenders covered by the survey is in Appendix 4.

Outstanding Loans

Over the first half of the year total lender books shrank marginally, the net result of a large gain in for North American banks, the smallest lender category, and a fall in the books of UK Banks (the category includes building societies).

Outstanding loans and commitments, £ million

	Outstanding Loans	Undrawn Commitments	Total book June 2018	Total book Dec 2017	% change H1 2018
UK Banks	70,416	17,077	87,493	96,409	-9.2%
German Banks	18,979	742	19,720	19,914	-1.0%
Other Banks	22,096	2,068	24,164	25,139	-3.9%
North American Banks	10,337	5,077	15,414	8,686	77.5%
Insurers	23,263	754	24,017	24,628	-2.5%
Other Lenders	18,353	4,904	23,257	24,244	-4.1%
All Lenders	163,444	30,622	194,066	199,020	-2.5%

Source: Cass CRE Lending Survey

Undrawn commitments, which in total changed little through the first half, are mainly made up of the early stage of residential development loans. Unless specified otherwise, all the analysis in this report applies to the outstanding loans total of £163.4 bn, excluding the undrawn commitments.

Loan Origination

The £22.5 bn in new loans originated (excluding undrawn commitments) in the first half of the year were close to half the total recorded for the whole of 2017, but registered a substantial gain over activity in the first half of that year. Since lending activity normally steps up toward the year end, total origination for 2018 is likely to fall in the £45 to £55 bn range seen in the last four years.

Loan originations, £ million

	Full Year 2017	First Half 2017	First Half 2018	First Half % change
UK Banks	21,424	8,118	10,121	25%
German Banks	5,740	2,050	2,667	30%
Other Banks	3,751	2,395	2,121	-11%
N American Banks	3,247	652	1,898	191%
Insurers	4,225	1,582	2,210	40%
Other Lenders	6,063	2,863	3,476	21%
All Lenders	44,450	17,659	22,492	27%

Source: Cass CRE Lending Survey

With the exception of "Other Banks" – ie excluding UK, Germany, US and Canada - all lender categories significantly increased their origination through the first half of 2018

compared to the same period 12 months earlier. At the same time the syndication market also saw a high volume of activity with £6.3bn of syndication, against £8.9bn recorded in the whole of 2017.

Debt and the market cycle

The twenty-year history of the CRE Lending Survey tracks the leverage cycle through the long boom of the early 2000s, followed by the marked collapse and deleveraging after 2007.

- Measured by outstanding loans, CRE lending has had only three states in 20 years: rising from 1999 to 2008, falling from 2008 to 2014 and since then, flat.
- Neither the volume of or direction in loan books have had any enduring connection with the health of the market, measured by movements in capital value or by trading volumes.
- Loan origination is, however, linked to values and trading in the underlying real estate market: both before and after the market crisis for example there was a persistent tendency for every £1 in real estate transactions to generate £0.5 in loan origination.
- However, that relationship broke down from 2004 to 2008: loan originations stood far above the level indicated by market activity, and ran on after strong market signals such as peak rates in capital growth, and even falling capital values.
- Which resulted in the wave of loan defaults and losses which peaked in 2012, and fully subsided only in 2016, a full ten years on from the peak in real estate capital values.

Lenders – loan books and origination

The CRE Lending Survey has tracked 9 years of continuous growth in loan books up to 2008 (at an average 20% per year) followed by six years of continuous contraction (at 7% per year) to 2014. Against a turbulent history, we are now in the fifth year of what looks like extraordinary stability in both loan volumes and market structure.

- Since 2014 total outstanding CRE loans have stuck between £160 bn and £170 bn, and annual loan originations have run in a tight band from £45 bn to £55 bn: the first half of 2018 falls in with this stability on both measures.
- From 2008 to 2014 a decline in market share of previously dominant lenders among UK Banks, and the entry new lenders such as form of debt funds run by asset managers, created a new, more diverse, lending marketplace with more providers plus a wider range in lender sizes and business models.
- That new structure also appears to have stabilised since 2014, with shares of outstanding loans settling around 60% for the traditional lenders – UK Banks, and Insurers – 30% for non-UK Banks, and 10% for Other - generally new – Lenders.
- While there is still a tilt in recent origination shares toward newer and smaller lenders, the new broad division of the market looks set to remain unchanged.

Collateral – loan types and market exposures

The Survey provides unique insights into the assets underlying lender loan books and originations, categorised by type of project, form of loan and asset location. At the aggregate level, loan books are dominated by senior debt secured by existing investment properties, with small fractions in riskier development project or subordinated loans. The split across lender types and sizes, however, shows strong differentiation in business models and risk exposure.

- Standing investment properties are collateral for 86% of outstanding loan value; development loans have edged up from a 2014 low of 9% to 13%, but stand well below their peak share of 21% in 2007.
- Senior loans – with first claim on underlying collateral – dominate loan books, with only 2.4% out outstanding debt, and 1.8% of origination in the first half of 2018, in the form of subordinated loans.
- Development exposure – currently mainly in the form of residential schemes - is highly concentrated into UK Banks (16% of outstanding loans) and newer Other Lenders (24%).
- Subordinated debt is highly concentrated among Other Lenders, who have accounted for 70% - 80% of origination since 2014, supplanting the bank lenders who previously dominated this segment of the market.

Underwriting – interest rates and lending terms

The current terms applied to lenders have adapted to the changes in regulatory frameworks and persistent low interest rates of the last decade. As in many other aspects, the June 2018 survey results suggest underwriting criteria have settled around a new normal.

- Typical borrowing costs have edged up from late 2016 with Swap margin and LIBOR increases and marginal falls in prime lending margins – although secondary lending margins have shown a distinct upward shift over the last eighteen months.
- The spread between average property yields and debt costs has narrowed to 150 bps; senior debt yield, calculated on the basis of the LTVs offered by lenders, stands around 8%, close to its long run average and 200 bps above its 2006 level.
- The upper bound for LTV ratios has settled at 55%-60% across primary and secondary assets across all sectors, showing the smallest range across asset types on record.
- Lending margins on senior loans and prime property, at 194 for office bps to 220 bps for industrial have changed only fractionally since 2016; margins for secondary retail and office loans have, however risen over the period, with close to 300 bps prevailing across all three sectors.
- In contrast to investments lending, margins on development loans have risen sharply since 2015 and, despite a dip through the first half of the year, remain close to previous peaks.

Loan book quality

On standard underwriting metrics, the status of loan books has improved enormously from the low points of 2010-2012, with LTVs suggesting good coverage against any dip in capital values, and very high levels of income cover now the standard – no doubt due to a tilt toward income-based lending criteria and away from simple LTV.

- The mid-2018 results, nonetheless, suggest the long trend toward stronger loan book quality reached an end-point at the end of 2017, with a small uptick in higher LTV and lower IRC loans, and the first rise in the incidence of defaults since 2011.
- And the risk metrics do vary across lender types: for banks of all origins, for example, 80% of outstanding loans by value are at 60% LTV or lower, while that proportion is under 40% for the new Other Lenders, who are more inclined to take on subordinated debt and development funding.

Appendix 4: Respondents to the mid-2018 Survey

Aberdeen Standard Investments	ING Real Estate
Aalto Invest LLP	Investec Bank (UK) Ltd
Aareal Bank AG	J P Morgan Securities
Aeriance Investments S.A.R.L	Laxfield Capital
AgFe	Landesbank Baden-Württemberg
ALG Asset Management (Europe) Limited	LaSalle Investment Management
Allied Irish Bank (GB)	Legal & General
Aldermore	Lloyds Banking Group
Al Rayan Bank	M & G Investment Management Ltd
Aviva Investors Real Estate Finance	Maslow Capital
Axa Real Estate	Man Group
Bank of America Merrill Lynch	Metropolitan Life Insurance Company
Bank of Ireland Group	Morgan Stanley
Barclays	Münchener Hypo Bank EG
Bayern LB London Branch	N M Rothschild and sons
Blackstone Real Estate Debt Strategies	Och Ziff Capital Management
BNP Paribas	Oversea-Chinese Banking Corporation Ltd
Cain Hoy Enterprises (UK) Limited	Pacific Life
Cambridge and Counties Bank	Partners Group (UK) Ltd
Canada Life Ltd	Partnership Life Assurance Company
Chenavari Investment Managers	pbb Deutsche Pfandbriefbank
Cheyne Capital Management (UK) LLP	Pluto Finance
Citi Group	Pramerica Real Estate Investors (Europe)
Close Brothers Property Finance	PGIM
Contour Capital	Principality Building Society
Coutts and Company	Royal Bank of Canada
Credit Agricole Corporate & IB	RateSetter
Clydsdale Bank	Santander Corporate & Commercial Banking
DekaBank	Starwood Capital Europe Advisers LLP
Deutsche Bank AG	Société Generale
DRC Capital LLP	Sumitomo Mitsui Trust Bank Limited
Europa Capital Mezzanine Ltd	TH Real Estate
GAM International Management Limited	The Royal Bank of Scotland
GreenOak Real Estate	UBS Asset Management
Hermes Investment Management	Urban Exposure Limited
Helaba Landesbank Hessen-Thüringen	Wells Fargo Bank International
HSBC Bank plc	Zorin Finance
ICG-Longbow	

ALLEN & OVERY



FitchRatings



Asset
Services

GVA



Cass Business School

106 Bunhill Row
London EC1Y 8TZ
T: +44 (0)20 7040 8600
www.cass.city.ac.uk

 youtube.com/user/cassprogrammes

 Cass Business School

 @cassbusiness

 facebook.com/cassoofficial

 instagram.com/cassbusinessschool



Cass Business School

In 2002, the School was renamed Sir John Cass Business School following a generous donation towards the development of its new Bunhill Row premises.

Sir John Cass's Foundation

Sir John Cass's Foundation has supported education in London since the 18th century and takes its name from its founder, Sir John Cass, who established a school in Aldgate in 1710. Born in the City of London in 1661, Sir John served as an MP for the City and was knighted in 1713.

City, University of London is an independent member of the University of London, which was established by Royal Charter in 1836. It consists of 18 independent member institutions of outstanding global reputation and several prestigious central academic bodies and activities.

